



**UNITED  
NATIONS**

**EP**

UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/5

---



**UNITED NATIONS  
ENVIRONMENT PROGRAMME  
MEDITERRANEAN ACTION PLAN**

21 May 2017  
Original: English

---

Meeting of the Mediterranean Informal Network on Compliance and Enforcement

Loutraki, Greece, 6-7 April 2017

### **Report of the Meeting**

For environmental and economic reasons, this document is printed in a limited number. Delegates are kindly requested to bring their copies to meetings and not to request additional copies.

---

UNEP/MAP  
Athens, 2017

## Table of Contents

	Pages
Report of the meeting	1-5
Annex I      List of Participants	
Annex II     Agenda of the Meeting	
Annex III    Conclusions and Recommendations	

## **Introduction**

1. In accordance with the UNEP/MAP Programme of Work 2016-2017 adopted by COP 19, Athens, Greece, 9-12 February 2016, the Secretariat organized the Meeting of the Mediterranean Informal Network on Compliance and Enforcement from 6 to 7 April 2017 in Greece.

2. The main objective of the meeting was to bring together national experts working in the environmental permitting and inspection systems to:

- a) review the proposed guides prepared by the Secretariat related to the application and selection of most adequate Best Available Technologies and related environmental inspection
- b) share best practices and recent developments related to the national environmental permitting, inspection and enforcement systems

## **Participation**

3. The meeting was attended by representatives from the following Contracting Parties: Albania, Algeria, Bosnia & Herzegovina, Croatia, Cyprus, Egypt, Greece, Israel, Italy, Lebanon, Libya, Malta, Montenegro, Morocco, Slovenia, Turkey and the State of Palestine. The UNEP/MAP Secretariat was represented by the MAP Coordinating Unit and MED POL Programme. The meeting was also attended by representatives of the European Union Network for the Implementation and Enforcement of Environmental Law (IMPEL) and the Mediterranean Information Office for Environment, Culture and Sustainable Development (MIO-ECSDE). The full list of participants is attached as Annex I to the present report.

### **Agenda item 1: Opening of the Meeting**

4. The meeting was opened by Ms. Tatjana Hema, Deputy-Coordinator of MAP - Barcelona Convention Secretariat.

### **Agenda item 2: Adoption of the Agenda and Election of Officers**

#### **a) Adoption of the Agenda**

5. The proposed Provisional agenda appearing in document UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/1, and its timetable was adopted and appears as Annex II to the present report.

#### **b) Election of officers**

6. In accordance with the Rules of procedures for meetings and conferences of the Contracting Parties, the meeting elected one (1) Chair, three (3) Vice-Chairs and one (1) Rapporteur from among the participants, as follows:

Chair:	Mr Georgios Melekis, Greece
Vice-Chair:	Mr Ali Elkekli, Libya
Vice-Chair:	Mr. Jawad Benhmidane, Morocco,
Vice-Chair:	Mr. Boris Žbona, Slovenia
Rapporteur:	Ms. Ledjana Bojaxhi, Albania

### **Agenda item 3: Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean region**

- a) State of play of National Inspection and Permitting Systems in place: success stories and barriers

- b) Collaboration with relevant Compliance and Enforcement Networks
- c) Ways and means to promote Compliance and Enforcement

7. All representatives of the Contracting Parties present at the meeting took the floor and introduced the most recent developments of the environmental inspection bodies and regulations in their countries. This session provided a great opportunity to briefly present the state of play of national inspection systems, and share concrete results regarding law implementation, success stories and challenges faced.

8. Mr Junker Harald, representative of IMPEL network made a presentation on the work carried at European level on issues related to environmental compliance and enforcement and informed a meeting on possible projects for collaboration.

9. Participants embarked on discussions with the view to propose concrete actions on ways and means to promote and enhance environmental law enforcement in the region in line with national legislation and obligations under the Barcelona Convention and its Protocols. In this respect the meeting highlighted that in spite of progress achieved and success stories, challenges are still considerable in particular related to a) insufficient human resources, b) needs for capacity building and enhancing technical competency of competent authorities in addressing both permitting and inspection and c) sharing best practices across the region and beyond.

10. The meeting recommended that the informal network on compliance and enforcement should provide more opportunities for the Contracting Parties and relevant organizations to work together to enhance environmental performance and effectiveness of national enforcement bodies within the scope of the MAP Programme of Work and highlighted the need for better collaboration with other enforcement networks such as IMPEL with the view to promote sharing of best practices and capacity building.

**Agenda item 4: Strengthening the Inspection and Permitting Systems to promote the use of Best Available Techniques (BAT)**

11. The Secretariat with technical support from a regional expert, presented the draft Guides for the introduction and inspection of BAT implementation in industrial facilities, aiming to assist the permitting authorities of the Contracting Parties to extract and evaluate the necessary information contained in the complex literature in order to assess the information provided by the applicants for permits concerning BAT introduction in industrial installations and ensure that their application is effective. Some examples of inspection checklists will be also presented.

**a) Guide on the selection of Best Available Techniques in Industrial installations**

12. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide and suggested minor changes to ensure further clarifications such as environmental quality standards.

13. The meeting agreed to recommend the proposed draft guide to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance permitting process and competence of the national authorities ensuring that the proper BAT are selected by the operators/proponents.

14. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation and recommended the development of a number of case studies by the Secretariat (waste water including sludge management, landfill management, petroleum refinery (next biennium), offshore Industry (next biennium), electric arc furnace).

15. The Contracting Parties were encouraged to prepare and send to the Secretariat, as appropriate case studies on BAT assessment addressing different sectors with a particular focus on those affecting marine and coastal environment with the view to demonstrate and highlight the Mediterranean success stories and promoting and sharing best practices in the region.

**b) Guide on Inspections of Industrial Facilities**

16. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide prepared by the Secretariat and suggested some changes to ensure a better streamlining of the enforcement indicators already agreed in the framework of the MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean. It agreed to recommend the draft Guide to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance national environmental inspection performance.

17. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation including exchange of inspection officers between countries and recommended that countries should consider reporting in future meetings of MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean, data and assessment of the performance inspection indicators and as appropriate their trends during the last years.

18. The meeting suggested to gradually extend the scope of the work of this network that may consider inspection activities related to other source of pollution such as dumping, offshore, etc., and in particular, the interaction of pollution impacts with the protection of marine and coastal biodiversity and highlighted the need for enhanced visibility of the work undertaken by the network and dissemination of its products.

**Agenda item 5: Conclusions and Recommendations**

19. The participants reviewed, commented and approved, the draft Conclusions and Recommendations prepared by the Rapporteur, as contained in Annex III to the present reporting including as appendixes both agreed Guides.

**Agenda item 6: Any Other Business**

No issue was raised under this Agenda item.

**Agenda item 7: Closure of the Meeting**

20. The Chair in his closing remarks thanked the participants for their constructive contribution to the meeting and the Secretariat and its MED POL team for all efforts made to organize this effective and very useful meeting.

21. After the expression of usual courtesies, the Chair declared the meeting closed at 17:30 p.m. on Friday, 7 April 2017.

**Annex I**  
**List of Participants**

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

<b>ALBANIA / ALBANIE</b>	<p><b>Ms. Ledjana Bojaxhi</b>  Head of Waste Management Unit  Sector of Waste  Ministry of Environment</p> <p>Tel: +355694112110  Cell: +355694112110  Email: ledjana_k@yahoo.com</p>
<b>ALGERIA / ALGERIE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Omar Alleg</b>  Regional Inspector of Environment  Ministry of Water and Environment</p> <p>Tel: +213432847  Cell: +21361321260  Fax: +213432848  Email: ireEst@yahoo.com</p>
<b>BOSNIA HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE HERZEGOVINE</b>	<p><b>Ms. Selma Cengic</b>  Executive Director  Hydro engineering Department  Hydro Engineering Institute Sarajevo</p> <p>Tel: +38733207949  Cell: +38761189063  Fax: +38733207949  Email: selma.cengic@heis.ba</p>
<b>CROATIA / CROATIE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Hrvoje Buljan</b>  Ministarstvo zaštite okoliša i energetike  Radnička cesta 80, Zagreb</p> <p>Tel. + 385 (1) 3717 178  Fax. +385 (1) 3717 135  Email: hrvoje.buljan@mzoip.hr</p>
<b>CYPRUS / CHYPRE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Andreas Athanasiades</b>  Environmental Officer  Department of Environment  Ministry of Agriculture, Rural Development and Environment</p> <p>Tel: +35722408935  Fax: +35722774945  Email: aathanasiades@environment.moa.gov.cy</p>

<b>EGYPT / EGYPTE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Mohamed Fahmi</b>  Researcher  Environment Impact Assessment  Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agenc</p> <p>Cell: +201223539809  Email: gemy_fahmy2000@yahoo.com</p>
<b>GREECE / GRÈCE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Georgios Melekis</b>  Special Secretariat for Water</p> <p>Tel: +302106475131  Cell: +306973825305  Email: gmelekis.egy@gmail.com</p>
<b>ISRAEL / ISRAEL</b>	<p><b>Mr. Ran Amir</b>  Director MEPD  Marine Environment Protection Division  Environmental Protection  Ministry of Environmental Protection</p> <p>Tel: +97248633501  Cell: +972506233050  Fax: +97248633520  Email: rani@sviva.gov.il, amirrani_2012@yahoo.com</p> <p><b>Mr. Rami Peleg</b>  Head Investigator  Marine Environment Protection Division  Ministry of Environmental Protection, Israel</p> <p>Cell: +972-05-6233005  Email: ramip@sviva.gov.il, ramipeleg@gmail.com</p>
<b>ITALY / ITALIE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Francesco Andreotti</b>  Environmental Inspector under IE Directive  VAL-R-TEC  Italian National Institute for Environmental Protection and Research  (ISPRA)</p> <p>Tel: +390650072424  Cell: +393294110852  Email: andreotti.francesco@gmail.com</p>
<b>LEBANON / LIBAN</b>	<p><b>Ms. Marwa El Mokdad</b>  Environmental Engineer  Service of Urban protection  Ministry of Environment - Service of Urban Protection</p> <p>Tel: +9613037057  Email: marwamokdad@hotmail.com</p>



<b>LIBYA/LIBYE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Ali Elkekli</b>  Director  Technical Cooperation &amp; Consultation  Environment General Authority  P. O. Box 83618</p> <p>Tel: +21821913777246  Email: arelkekli@gmail.com</p>
<b>MALTA / MALTE</b>	<p><b>Ms. Ritianne Stellini</b>  Senior Officer - Compliance and Enforcement  Compliance and Enforcement Unit  Environment and Resources Authority</p> <p>Tel: +35622923808  Email: ritianne.stellini-galea@era.org.mt, ritty_87@hotmail.com</p>
<b>MONTENEGRO / MONTÉNEGRO</b>	<p><b>Mrs. Ivana Bulatovic</b>  Advisor in EPA Montenegro  Monitoring, Analyses and Reporting  Environmental Protection Agency</p> <p>Tel: +38220446514  Cell: +38267225515  Email: ivana.bulatovic@epa.org.me</p> <p><b>Ms. Ivana Stojanovic</b>  Adviser  Department for Sustainable Development and Integrated Coastal  Zone Management  Ministry of Sustainable Development and Tourism</p> <p>Tel: +38267338108  Email: stojanovic_ivana@hotmail.com</p>
<b>MOROCCO / MAROC</b>	<p><b>Mr. Jawad Benhmidane</b>  Chef de Service Police de l'Environnement  Direction de Contrôle  Ministère de l'Environnement</p> <p>Tel: +212537570614  Cell: +212668921103  Email: jawadbenhmidane@yahoo.fr</p> <p><b>Mr. Moulay Lahcen Ouahidi</b>  Head of Department analysis of micropolluants  Laboratoire National des Etudes et de Surveillance de la Pollution  Ministry of Energy, Mining, Water and Environment</p> <p>Tel: +212537770321  Cell: +212672265150  Email: mouahidi2@yahoo.fr</p>

<b>SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Boris Žbona</b> Inspector for the Environment Inspectorate for Environment and Spatial Planning Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning</p> <p>Tel: +38653311882 Cell: +38631669638 Fax: +38634252733 Email: boris.zbona@gov.si</p>
<b>TURKEY / TURQUIE</b>	<p><b>Mr. Muhammed Tarik Durmus</b> Chemical Engineer (MSc) DG Environmental Impact Assessment Permit And Inspection Ministry of Environment an Urbanization</p> <p>Tel: +903124101970 Cell: +905364322843 Email: mtarik.durmus@csb.gov.tr</p>
<b>OBSERVER</b>	
<b>STATE OF PALESTINE / ETAT DE PALESTINE</b>	<p><b>Mrs. Kahramana Al-Kelani</b> Director of International Relations International Relations Environment Quality Authority</p> <p>Tel: +9702403495 Cell: +970599240215 Fax: +9702403494 Email: kah_kelani@yahoo.com</p> <p><b>Mr. Ibrahim Amjad</b> EIA Manager Environmental Protection Environment Quality Authority</p> <p>Cell: +972597308647 Fax: +97022403494 Email: amjadibrahim69@yahoo.com</p>

**REPRESENTATIVES OF UNITED NATIONS SPECIALIZED AGENCIES AND OTHER  
INTERGOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS/REPRESENTANTS DES INSTITUTIONS  
SPECIALISEES DES NATIONS UNIES ET AUTRES ORGANISATIONS  
INTERGOUVERNEMENTALES**

**EUROPEAN UNION NETWORK  
FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
AND ENFORCEMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
(IMPEL)**

**Mr. Harald Junker**

Dipl. Ing.  
Umweltbundesamt

Tel: +4934021033045

Cell: +491772620022

Email: harald.junker@uba.de

**NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS  
ORGANISATIONS NON-GOUVERNEMENTALES**

<b>MEDITERRANEAN INFORMATION OFFICE FOR ENVIRONMENT, CULTURE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (MIO-ECSDE).</b>	<b>Ms. Anastasia Roniotes</b> Head Officer Mediterranean Information Office for Environment, Culture and Sustainable Development (MIO-ECSDE)  Tel: +302103247490 Fax: +302103317127 Email: <a href="mailto:info@mio-ecsde.org">info@mio-ecsde.org</a>
---	--

**SECRETARIAT TO THE BARCELONA CONVENTION  
AND COMPONENTS OF THE MEDITERRANEAN ACTION PLAN  
SECRETARIAT DE LA CONVENTION DE BARCELONE ET COMPOSANTES DU PLAN  
D'ACTION POUR LA MEDITERRANEE**

<b>UNEP/MAP PNUE/PAM</b>	<b>Ms Tatjana Hema</b> Deputy Coordinator  Tel:+30 210 7273115 E-mail: tatjana.hema@unep.org
<b>CONSULTANT</b>	<b>Mr. Dimitrios Tsotsos</b>  Tel: +306936773334 Email: tsotsosd@gmail.com

**Annex II**  
**Agenda of the Meeting**

### **Agenda of the Meeting**

- |                |   |
|----------------|---|
| Agenda item 1. | Opening of the Meeting  |
| Agenda item 2. | Adoption of the Agenda and Election of Officers   |
| Agenda item 3. | Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean region  |
| Agenda item 4. | Strengthening the Inspection and Permitting Systems to promote the use of Best Available Techniques (BAT) |
| Agenda item 5. | Conclusions and Recommendations   |
| Agenda item 6. | Any Other Business  |
| Agenda item 7. | Closure of the meeting  |

**Annex III**  
**Conclusions and Recommendations**



## Conclusions and Recommendations

The Meeting of the Mediterranean Informal Network on Compliance and Enforcement was held on 6-7 April 2017, at the Club Hotel Casino Loutraki, Loutraki, Greece.

The meeting brought together national experts working in the environmental permitting and inspection systems. Following review and discussions of all agenda items, the meeting agreed on the following deliberations, conclusions and recommendations:

### Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean region

1. Following the presentations made by all countries represented at the Meeting, it was acknowledged that important progress has been achieved in setting up and strengthening national environmental inspection systems which are operational in all Mediterranean countries.
2. Lessons learnt shared during the meeting show clear progress in ensuring effective collaboration among different inspection bodies at national level, enhancing compliance, pollution reduction; protection of endangered species.
3. The meeting highlighted that in spite of progress achieved and success stories, challenges are still considerable in particular related to a) insufficient human resources, b) needs for capacity building and enhancing technical competency of competent authorities in addressing both permitting and inspection, (i.e, risk assessment for effective inspection planning, enforcement indicators and evaluation of environmental benefits of inspections, prevention of non-compliance, shipment of waste, etc.) c) sharing best practices across the region and beyond.
4. The meeting recommended that the informal network on compliance and enforcement established under the MAP/BC should provide more opportunities for the Contracting Parties and relevant organizations to work together to enhance environmental performance and effectiveness of national enforcement bodies within the scope of the MAP Programme of work.
5. The meeting also highlighted the need for better collaboration with other enforcement networks such as IMPEL with the view to promote sharing of best practices and capacity building.

### **Strengthening the Inspection and Permitting Systems to promote the use of Best Available Techniques (BAT)** (*UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/3Corr.1, UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/4*)

#### **Guide on the Selection of Best Available Techniques (BAT) in Industrial Installations**

(*UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/3Corr.1*)

6. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide prepared by the Secretariat related to the application and selection of most adequate Best Available Techniques in the permitting process and appreciated its content, usefulness and practicality. The meeting suggested minor changes to ensure further clarifications such as environmental quality standards.
7. The meeting agreed to recommend the proposed draft as contained in Appendix I to these conclusions and recommendations, to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance permitting process and competence of the national authorities ensuring that the proper BAT are selected by the operators/proponents.
8. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation.

9. The meeting recommended the following case studies to be developed by the Secretariat to address BAT assessment in the permitting system:

- a) Waste water including sludge management
- b) Landfill management
- c) Petroleum refinery (next biennium)
- d) Offshore Industry (next biennium)
- e) Electric arc furnace

10. The meeting encouraged all Contracting Parties to prepare, as appropriate, and send to the Secretariat, as appropriate case studies on BAT assessment addressing different sectors with a particular focus on those affecting marine and coastal environment with the view to demonstrate and highlight the Mediterranean success stories and promoting and sharing best practices in the region.

### **Guide on Inspection of Industrial Facilities**

*UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/4*

11. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide prepared by the Secretariat related to the Best Available Techniques inspection process and suggested some changes to ensure a better streamlining of the enforcement indicators already agreed in the framework of the MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean.

12. The meeting agreed to recommend the proposed draft as contained in Appendix I to these conclusions and recommendations, to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance national environmental inspection performance. The meeting recommended to add a footnote to the annexes in order to highlight that the annexes have been prepared for indicative purposes only.

13. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation including exchange of inspection officers between countries.

14. The meeting agreed and recommended that countries should consider reporting in future meetings of MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean, data and assessment of the performance inspection indicators and as appropriate their trends during the last years.

15. Finally the meeting also suggested to gradually extend the scope of the work of this network that may consider inspection activities related to other source of pollution such as dumping, offshore, etc., and in particular, the interaction of pollution impacts with the protection of marine and coastal biodiversity.

16. The meeting requested the Secretariat to make more visible the work undertaken by this informal network and disseminate its product by creating for example a clear link on UNEP/MAP website on enforcement and compliance

17. At the request of the Meeting it was agreed to allocate one week for any additional comments to be sent to the Secretariat.